REPORT

Technical Consultation on Polio Eradication in Afghanistan and Pakistan

Muscat, 1 – 2 October 2007
1. INTRODUCTION

A technical consultation on poliomyelitis eradication in Afghanistan and Pakistan was held in Muscat, Oman from 1 – 2 October 2007, with the objective of reviewing progress towards poliomyelitis eradication in the two countries, particularly, during the last six months since the meeting of the Technical Advisory Group on poliomyelitis eradication in both countries, which was held in Islamabad in April 2007. The consultation also aimed at discussing planned activities in the remaining period of 2007 and early 2008 and making recommendations on technical aspects necessary to help the programme to achieve the milestones set by the stakeholders meeting held in Geneva in February 2007.

The consultation was addressed by Dr Hussein A. Gezairy, RD/EMRO and by Dr Ali Jaffer, Senior Advisor to the Ministry of Health in Oman. It was attended by some members of the TAG on poliomyelitis eradication in Afghanistan and Pakistan, EPI managers and WHO representatives, of both countries, WHO and UNICEF staff from HQs, Regional and country levels and by representatives from CDC and USAID. Dr Nicholas Ward, Chairman of the TAG Afghanistan and Pakistan chaired the meeting. Programme and list of participants are attached (Annexes 1 and 2).

2. EPIDEMIOLOGICAL SITUATION:

Global situation:

Dr Bruce Aylward briefed the meeting on the global situation. Utilizing the milestones set by the stakeholders meeting in February 2007 as indicators of progress, it was indicated that for the first indicator (% decrease in number of infected districts), there has been more than 50% decrease in type 1 polio infected districts in each of the four endemic countries. Addressing the second milestone set by the stakeholders meeting, it is noted that, in general, the average number of doses per child in endemic zones is nearly comparable to that of polio free zones.

It is noted, however, that the % Zero dose children in endemic zones is, particularly, high in Nigeria and in the southern zone of Afghanistan, while in India, Pakistan and Eastern Afghanistan the rates in endemic and polio free zones is around 1%.

With respect to the third milestone related to re-infected countries it was noted that 31 of the 34 importations in 2006 has stopped in 2007 and only three are continuing. In addition, five new importations were reported in 2007.

As regards the forth milestone namely that the programme would have received the required funding for 2007 by the middle of the year; it is noted that the 2007 budget still has a short fall of USD 60 millions.

Dr Aylward also summarized new data on the impact of mOPV1 which demonstrates that irrespective of the setting or type of study, there has been a 2-4 fold higher per dose efficacy against type 1 polio as compared with tOPV. Although efficacy data on mOPV3 are not yet available, from the epidemiologic impact in India it appears that this vaccine has a per dose
efficacy at least similar to that of mOPV1. While mOPVs were originally designed for areas of particularly intense poliovirus transmission, the very high per dose efficacy of these vaccines may be especially valuable in areas where access to children is limited and/or sporadic; such as in some insecure and conflict-affected areas. The eradication programme has already taken advantage of these characteristics of mOPVs to conduct multiple rounds of vaccination with a specific mOPV within a very short timeframe (i.e. 10-14 days) during the windows of opportunity when access was possible.

**Situation in Afghanistan and Pakistan:**

In Pakistan in 2007, up till end September, 13 cases due to wild polio viruses (WPV) were detected compared to 23 reported during the same period in 2006. They comprised six cases due to WPV type 3 and seven cases due to WPV type 1. Cases due to type 3 occurred mostly early in the year and represented the tail of the type 3 outbreak observed from mid 2006. They were mostly concentrated in a limited geographical area between Baluchistan and North Sindh provinces. Four of the seven cases due to WPV type 1 were reported from NWFP/FATA, one of them being the case that was discovered in Australia. Two of the other three cases were reported from Baldia town of Karachi and the third one from the neighbouring Thatta province in Sindh.

In Afghanistan, the first reported case of WPV in 2007 had its date of onset 10 April. Up till end September, 10 cases of poliomyelitis were detected compared to 28 cases reported during the same period in 2006. The first four cases (10 April to 16 June) were all due to WPV type 1. They were followed by six cases (30 June to 5 September) all of them caused by WPV type 3. Type 1 cases were reported as single cases, one from each of the provinces of Hilmand, Kandahar, Laghman and Nangarhar, while the following six cases due to WPV 3 were three cases from each of the provinces of Hilmand and Kandahar.

Epidemiologic and virologic data of the two countries indicate that there are two cross-border active endemic transmission zones;

The first zone comprises central NWFP/FATA region in Pakistan and eastern Afghanistan area, where both type 1 and type 3 polioviruses have been detected during the past 12 months, but where only type 1 has been isolated since January 2007. Access to children in this area has been compromised by a combination of factors including strong local autonomy, refusals, traditional culture, etc. In this transmission zone, optimal use of mOPVs can be accurately guided by surveillance data.

The second transmission zone is geographically larger, extending from the intersection of Hilmand, Kandahar and Uruzgan provinces in southern Afghanistan, through Baluchistan, into northern Sindh in Pakistan. Endemic viruses from this zone are regularly detected in Karachi and adjacent districts. Both type 1 and type 3 viruses have been detected in this area during the past six months, but with type 3 predominating in the southern Afghanistan-northern Sindh corridor (only type 1 poliovirus has been detected in Karachi). Access in this transmission zone is compromised by insecurity resulting from active conflict, particularly in southern Afghanistan, and the highly mobile nature of substantial populations in this zone.
In the second transmission zone, optimizing the use of mOPVs is complicated by the regular reappearance of each serotype in southern Afghanistan and, to a lesser degree, northern Sindh, after periods of 6-12 months without having detected it.

It was noted that there is progressive decrease in the genetic sub-clusters of wild viruses detected in the two countries. The 10 sub-clusters (seven type 1 and three type 3) detected in 2005 decreased to seven (five type 1 and two type 3) in 2006 and further decreased to only four sub-clusters (three type 1 and one type 3) in 2007. The origin and duration of existence of these sub-clusters show that they are surviving through movement between the two countries.

Assessing achievements against the globally set milestones for 2007 shows that the two countries are more or less on target with respect to the number of infected districts. As regards the immunity levels against polio among children 6 – 35 months, it is evident that in Pakistan in 2007, the percent of AFP cases, from 2006 infected districts, who received seven doses or more, have almost equal status to those cases from non infected districts. In Afghanistan, AFP cases from infected districts of 2006, showed some improvement in the percent who received seven OPV doses, yet this rate is still lagging behind that of AFP cases from non infected districts. It was also noted that the rate with zero dose increased from 4% in 2006 to 12% in 2007. This is mainly due to the difficult security situation, which continued to prevail in 2007 preventing accessibility to children.

The following points were noted from presentations and discussions:

1. The meeting was impressed with the fact that in response to the recommendations of the TAG, the poliomyelitis eradication teams prepared plans of action to address the recommendations and they were implemented to a large extent:

   - Concentration of efforts was made on known remaining areas of transmission.
   - Surveillance has been maintained at certification standards all over Pakistan as evidenced from the various indicators. In Afghanistan, surveillance continued to be generally good. However, some indicators are borderline reflecting delays in reporting, particularly, in some regions. Laboratory support to the two programmes, through NIH, has been of an excellent level and represents vital support to eradication efforts through rapid provision of laboratory results and by the genomic sequencing carried out on the isolates.
   - Maintaining high levels of overall population protection. It was noted that additional opportunities to administer OPV were utilized, particularly, in high risk areas. Measles immunization campaign was one example. In Pakistan, it has been, particularly, helpful to reach children in areas with high refusal rates.
   - Rapid detection of the appearance of the WPV in polio free areas and appropriate, timely mop up in response e.g. in Karachi and Thatta.
   - Licensure of mOPV3 in Pakistan and starting its use in the districts representing the corridor of movement between Pakistan and Southern Afghanistan to guard against the possibility of spread of WPV type 3. It was also used in September NID in areas of type 3 circulation in Afghanistan (Hilmand and Kandahar).

2. The meeting noted the multiplicity of efforts being made to address the problem of refusals, which has reached levels of concern in a limited number of districts and was
pleased to note that the planned study in Pakistan on the pattern and causes of refusals. It is expected that this study will provide useful results that could be used to address the problem.

3. It was noted, with satisfaction, that the efforts made by the programme in Afghanistan has been successful to obtain a letter from the Shura of Taliban in favour of the polio immunization campaign and the fact that for the first time, for more than one year, over 80,000 children under 5 were vaccinated during the September round. It is hopeful that this accessibility would be maintained in future rounds. Continuation of efforts to engage the community leaders in Afghanistan and Pakistan is needed to assure continued access to the under-immunized children.

4. Coordination of polio eradication activities between Pakistan and Afghanistan were pursued vigorously. The dates of SIAs were coordinated, border area activities especially immunization of crossing children continued, unification of monitoring indicators and exchange of information continued to be regularly implemented.

3. COMMUNICATION REVIEWS:

The consultation was briefed about the international communication reviews for the poliomyelitis eradication programmes in Pakistan and Afghanistan, which were conducted during the two weeks preceding the consultation. The recommendations of these reviews were presented. It was noted that:

- **Pakistan:** has a strong national communication approach, which needs to be fine tuned at the district/sub-district level based on available data. It was noted that plans are being pursued vigorously to rapidly recruit the required human resources at provincial and district levels to intensify activities, particularly, in high risk areas. Planned activities will be based on the trend analysis and data driven strategies and measurement of impact.

- **Afghanistan:** the review noted the strong political commitment exhibited for poliomyelitis eradication, involvement of religious and community leaders and enhancement of social mobilization in high risk areas. However, gaps were identified in the communication strategy at national and provincial levels with insufficient human capacity to implement social mobilization/communication strategies and the limited programme data related to communication and limited use of existing data. The identified priorities included development of a comprehensive communication strategy for national and provincial levels, insuring development of indicators and updated micro-plans at district and sub-district levels and to strengthen capacity at different levels ensuring presence of district communication coordinator in all high risk districts.

4. CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

**Conclusions:**

1. The consultation was impressed by the continued efforts made by the programme in the two countries towards achievement of the target of poliomyelitis eradication. The low
persistent transmission does not reflect failure of the strategies being implemented; it is
however a reflection of the last phase of the epidemiologic situation and the operational
difficulties of access in certain limited areas.

The following is noted with satisfaction:

– Sustained political commitment at national and sub-national levels.
– Continued improvement in SIA quality particularly in high risk areas.
– Maintaining certification standard surveillance
– Close coordination of activities between the two countries especially in relation to
  border area activities.
– Licensure of mOPV3 and start of its utilization in both countries.
– Conduct of communication reviews in both countries.
– Successful efforts to ensure accessibility to children living in insecure areas in
  southern region of Afghanistan.
– Preparation of a three year plan in Pakistan with clear government inputs

2. The vast majority of population, in both Pakistan and Afghanistan, live in polio free
areas as wild polio virus transmission is currently focal in two main areas:

– NWFP/FATA and neighbouring parts of eastern Afghanistan.
– Corridor of movement from southern region of Afghanistan through Baluchistan to
  northern Sindh.

3. There are still some important challenges facing the programmes including:

– Need to achieve/maintain engagement of political leadership, particularly, at
  peripheral levels.
– Prevailing volatile security situation in Afghanistan and border areas of Pakistan.
– Increasing percentage of refusals in some areas.
– Continued danger of exchange of viruses through mobile populations.

Recommendations:

1. Recommendations of the last TAG:

The strategic directions and recommendations outlined in the report of the TAG meeting
of April 2007 are still valid and generally represent the line of thoughts to be followed,
particularly, in relation to the following priorities in order to achieve the eradication
goals:

– Concentration of efforts on known remaining areas of transmission and high risk
  areas using the appropriate monovalent vaccine.
– Improved access to all children and overcoming security problems.
– Ensuring high level of operational quality of SIAs and AFP surveillance
– Maintaining high level of overall population protection by periodic NIDs using tOPV in non endemic areas and improvement in routine immunization coverage of infants.
– Rapid detection and mop up response to appearance of virus into polio free areas using the appropriate monovalent vaccine.

2. Planned SIAs and type of vaccine to be used:

The following schedule and type of vaccine is recommended for the next six months:

For Pakistan:

• NID October:
  – mOPV3/mOPV1 trans. zones
  – tOPV all other areas
• SNID December – mOPV1
• NID January:
  – mOPV3 transmission zones
  – tOPV all other areas
• SNID February – mOPV1
• SNID March – mOPV3
• NID April
  – mOPV1 transmission zones
  – tOPV all other areas

For Afghanistan

• NID October
  – mOPV3/mOPV1 trans. zones
  – tOPV all other areas
• SNID December – mOPV1
• SNID January - mOPV3
• SNID February – mOPV1
• NID March
  – mOPV1 or mOPV3 transmission zones
  – tOPV all other areas
• NID April
  – mOPV1 or mOPV3 transmission zones
  – tOPV all other areas
3. Communication:

The consultation endorses the general principles of the communications reviews, including the proposal to include a communications expert on the TAG, but requests:

- Clear enunciation (by end October) of specific indicators that the TAG and country programmes can use to monitor progress.
- Given the extensive recommendations arising from the communications reviews, the consultation re-emphasizes that priority must given to those which will directly impact the programme during the coming six month period, with full integration of this work into the existing eradication programme and the avoidance, at all costs, of establishing separate structures.
- Immediate priorities would appear to be activities that address the immunization of very young children, mobile populations and issues related to refusals.

4. Surveillance:

In addition to the current analysis being undertaken, it is recommended that the Afghanistan team develop a series of rolling six month maps for the Southern Region showing districts as 'silent' or 'reporting' in terms of AFP cases, to facilitate district-level monitoring of the evolving AFP surveillance sensitivity in this critical area.

5. Resources:

- The consultation commends the recent announcements by the Government of Pakistan of the allocation of substantial additional domestic resources for OPV procurement, and urges the finalization and publication of these long term funding commitments as part of the Governments three year plan for eradication activities.
- To be able to respond to cases discovered outside zones of transmission, a reserve stock of 8 million doses of mOPV1 and mOPV3 (4 million each) should be established for each of Afghanistan and Pakistan.
Annex 1

PROGRAMME

Monday, 1 October 2007

Opening Session

08.45 – 09:00   Registration
09:00 – 09:30   Opening Session:
   • Address by Dr Hussein A. Gezairy
     Regional Director, WHO/EMR
   • Representative of the Ministry of Health Dr Ali Jaffar, MOH/OMAN
   • Objectives of the Consultation Dr M. H. Wahdan,
     WHO/EMRO
   • Global progress towards polio eradication Dr Bruce Aylward, WHO/HQ

SESSION I: PAKISTAN

09:30 – 10:30   Epidemiological situation in Pakistan Dr N’ima Abid, WHO/ Pakistan
10:30 – 11:00   SIA quality and plans Dr N’ima Abid, WHO/ Pakistan
11:00 – 12:00   Discussion & questions to the consultation National EPI Manager, Pakistan
12:00 – 12:30   Break
12:30 – 13:00   Report on communication review, Pakistan UNICEF

SESSION II: AFGHANISTAN

13:00 – 14:30   Epidemiological situation & surveillance data Dr Tahir Mir, WHO/Afghanistan
14:30 – 15:00   SIA quality and plans Dr Tahir Mir, WHO/Afghanistan
15:00 – 15:30   Break
15:30 – 16:30   Discussion & questions to the consultation National EPI Manager, Afghanistan
16:30 – 17:00   Report on communication review, Afghanistan UNICEF
18:00          Iftar

Tuesday, 2 October 2007

SESSION III

09:00 – 11:00   Discussion and finalization of recommendations
11:00 – 11:30   Break
11:30 – 12:30   Closing
Annex 2

LIST OF PARTICIPANTS

TAG MEMBERS

Dr Nicholas Ward  
Chairman  
Stowford Meadow  
Langtree  
Devon EX 38 8 NU  
UNITED KINGDOM

Dr Olen Kew  
Molecular Virology Section  
Centers for Disease Control and Prevention  
Atlanta  
USA

Dr Howard Gary  
National Immunization Programme  
Centers for Disease Control and Prevention  
Atlanta  
USA

Dr Stephen L. Cochi  
Senior Advisor Immunization Division  
National Immunization Program  
Centers for Disease Control and Prevention, CDC  
Atlanta  
USA

Dr Hamid Jafari  
Project Manager National Polio Surveillance Project  
World Health Organization  
Regional Office for South-East Asia, WHO/SEARO  
New Delhi 110002  
INDIA
Dr Arun Thapa*
Regional Adviser
World Health Organization
Regional Office for South-East Asia, WHO/SEARO
New Delhi 110002
INDIA

Dr M.H. Wahdan
Special Adviser to the Regional Director
For Poliomyelitis Eradication
WHO/EMRO
Cairo
EGYPT

Dr Faten Kamel
Medical Officer/POL
WHO/EMRO
Cairo
EGYPT

Mr Christopher Maher
Coordinator, Strategy Implementation
Oversight & Monitoring, WHO/HQ
Geneva
SWITZERLAND

Dr Rudolf Tangermann
Medical Officer
Polio Eradication Team, WHO/HQ
Geneva
SWITZERLAND

Dr Maria Otelia Costales
Senior Health Advisor
Global Polio Eradication Program
Health Section, Programme Division,
UNICEF HQ
New York
USA

* Apologized
Professor Tariq Bhutta  
National TAG Member  
Government of Pakistan  
Punjab  
PAKISTAN

REGIONAL TAG

Dr Ali Jaffer Mohamed  
Chairman  
Advisor Health Affairs  
Supervisor Directorate General Health Affairs  
Ministry of Health  
Muscat  
OMAN

MINISTRIES OF HEALTH

AFGHANISTAN

Dr Aghagul Dost  
National EPI Manager  
Ministry of Public Health  
Kabul

PAKISTAN

Dr Rehan Abdul Hafiz  
National EPI Manager  
National Institute of Health  
Federal Ministry of Health  
Government of Pakistan  
Islamabad

OTHER ORGANIZATIONS

UNICEF

Dr Rafah Salam Aziz  
Polio Senior Advisor, Health Section  
Programme Division, UNICEF/HQ  
Geneva  
SWITZERLAND
Dr Pankaj Mehta  
Immunization, Health and Nutrition Specialist  
UNICEF/ROSA  
Kathmandu  
NEPAL

Dr Ibrahim Elziq  
Chief, Health and Nutrition  
Islamabad  
PAKISTAN

Dr Azhar Abid Raza  
Project Officer, Immunization  
Islamabad  
PAKISTAN

Ms Melissa Corkum  
Communication Officer  
Islamabad  
PAKISTAN

USAID

Ms Ellyn W. Ogden  
USAID Worldwide Polio Eradication Coordinator  
Washington, DC  
USA

Mr Chris Morry  
Director, Coordination and Special Projects  
The Communication Initiative  
USAID  
Washington, DC  
USA

CDC

Dr Elias Durry  
Team Leader VPDEEB  
Global Immunization Division  
Centers for Disease Control and Prevention  
Atlanta  
USA
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Position</th>
<th>Organization</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Dr Hussein A. Gezairy</td>
<td>Regional Director, EMR</td>
<td>WHO/EMRO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dr Jihan Tawilah</td>
<td>WHO Representative, Oman</td>
<td>WHO/OMAN</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dr Riyad Musa Ahmed</td>
<td>WHO Representative, Afghanistan</td>
<td>WHO/AFGHANISTAN</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dr Khalif Bile Mohamud</td>
<td>WHO Representative, Pakistan</td>
<td>WHO/PAKISTAN</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dr Bruce Aylward</td>
<td>Director, Polio Eradication Initiative</td>
<td>WHO/HQ</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dr Tahir Mir</td>
<td>Medical Officer</td>
<td>WHO/AFGHANISTAN</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dr N’ima Abid</td>
<td>Medical Officer</td>
<td>WHO/PAKISTAN</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dr M. Obaid ul Islam</td>
<td>AFP Surveillance Coordinator, SSA</td>
<td>WHO/PAKISTAN</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ms Wallaa El Moawen</td>
<td>Polio Secretary</td>
<td>WHO/EMRO</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>